BROOKLYN COMMUNITY BOARD 6
LANDMARK/LAND USE COMMITTEE
OCTOBER 25, 2012

ATTENDANCE:
PRESENT:

J. ARMER	P. BLAKE	W. BLUM
Y. GIRELA	G. KELLY	R. LEVINE
M. MURPHY	J. REISCHEL	M. SHAMES
E. SHIPLEY	R. SLOANE	D. WILLIAMS

EXCUSED:

R. LUFTGLASS	S. MILLER	T. MISKEL
A. REEVES	E. SPICER	B. STOLTZ

GUESS:

G. SHAPIRO	M. MITCHELL	M. RABKIN
A. GOODRICH	J. EMANUELE	R. SMITH
M. ABLON	A. BESHEER	J. NEGRYCZ
J. MONTALBANO	N. RAWLINSON	L. BURR
B.WRONSKA-KUCY	M. HUDOBENKO	E. DIFRONZO
P. COWLEY		

*** MINUTES ***

The meeting was called to order at 6:13pm.

Presentation and review of a Certificate of Appropriateness application submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a new door opening to the terrace at the lot line wall, replacement of the parapet railings, and new pergola at the Montauk Club, 25 8th Avenue (northeast corner Lincoln Place/8th Avenue), Park Slope Historic District.

Montauk Club: New door and pergola
- Discussion about why proposed lintel is not a copy of the original. Historical preservationists prefer additions to be different so as to differentiate from the historic features.
  - Glenn Kelly and Roy Sloane prefer exact reproductions.
  - Jerry Armer requested more info on proposed lintel design presented by the architect.
- Discussion of pergola: proposed is metal and slightly arched.
  - Roy Sloane had concerns about future enclosures of the pergola.

Jerry Armer made a motion for conditional approval. Conditions being:
1. Lintels should have similar (not exact) ornamentation.
2. Railings should not be a mesh design, but vertical rails.
3. Pergola should not have covering or attachments that provide for covering.

VOTE: 10…..YEAS 2…..NAYS 0…..ABSTENTIONS
MOTION APPROVED

Presentation and review of a Certificate of Appropriateness application submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a rear yard addition and modification to the existing front entrance

vestibule at this two-story townhouse located at 545 8th Street (between 8th Avenue/Prospect Park West), Park Slope Historic District.

545 8th Street: Rear yard addition and modification of entry.
- Roy Sloane thinks windows are not contextual.
- Elizabeth Shipley thinks the whole extension is too big.

Jerry Armer moved to conditionally approve with 6-over-1 windows of similar look and size to original.

VOTE: 10…..YEAS   2…..NAYS   0…..ABSTENTIONS
MOTION APPROVED

Madelaine Murphy moved to send a letter to the Department of Buildings requesting clarification on rear yard requests for this zoning – R6B. Pauline Blake seconded.

Motion was made that CB6 send a letter to Landmark Preservation Commission requesting clarification on approval process re: 193 Congress Street which appears to have been approved without review by Landmarks/Land Use.

MOTION APPROVED: UNANIMOUSLY

Presentation and review of a Certificate of Appropriateness application submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for the lowering of the cellar and underpinning of 20 Montgomery Place (between 8th Avenue/Prospect Park West), Park Slope Historic District.

20 Montgomery Place: Lowering cellar and underpinning.
- Jerry Armer asked if there are any changes to the exterior of any kind. Presenter answered no.
- Elizabeth Shipley asked if building is an individual landmark. No.

Roy Sloane moved to approve all proposed interior work as presented. Jerry Armer seconded.

VOTE: 11…..YEAS   0…..NAYS   1…..ABSTENTION
MOTION APPROVED

Motion was made to request clarification from the LPC as to why the 20 Montgomery Place application was sent to us in the first place if all work was interior.

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Presentation and review of a Certificate of Appropriateness application submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for comprehensive renovations and alterations to the building and carriage house located at 364 Henry Street (northwest corner Congress/Henry Streets), Cobble Hill Historic District.

364 Henry Street: Comprehensive alterations.
- Community member objects to the change to a dog-leg stoop from a straight stoop.
- Roy Sloane stated that the Cobble Hill Association did not review the proposal and so has no position.
- Jerry Armer said the change to the stoop conflicts with the character of the block.

- Robert Levine is concerned about the sheer amount of decorative and other changes. This seems to borrow too many discrete elements and glues them together.
- Other community comments: some supportive, some concerned about the size of the bulkhead and size of curb cuts.
- Elizabeth Shipley feels the project is ostentatious and adds too many elements that increase the size of the building. The decoration is excessive, and out of character, and the addition of the connective hallway and ornate bulkhead make it out of scale. Row houses are meant to be harmonious and this is the opposite.
- Jerry Armer shares her concerns and thinks the connective hallway to the carriage house is too modern and glossy. He also thinks the bays/oriels on Congress Street are too heavy.
- Roy Sloane gateway building to the community was saved from demolition by the community. He thinks the project adds too many new architectural elements. He would support a simpler look but not as presented. Elements proposed are from too many periods and styles.

Bill Blum made a motion to disapprove as presented with a request for a second review of modified proposal prior to LPC decision. Concerns include the ornate building, bay windows, reorientation of the stoop, addition of hallway over the garage and sheer volume of decorative elements.

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Jerry Armer made a motion to approve the minutes of the previous meeting held on September 27, 2012 with a correction to the attendance. Robert Levine was present.

MOTION APPROVED: UNANIMOUSLY

Madelaine Murphy made a motion to request that LPC hold open the record until after the full Board meeting.

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

Bill Blum made a motion to adjourn.

MOTION PASSED: UNANIMOUSLY

The minutes were submitted by Elizabeth Shipley.